

Evidence-Based Public Policy toward Cold Fusion

by

Thomas W. Grimshaw, Ph.D.

Professional Report

Presented to the Faculty of the Graduate School

of The University of Texas at Austin

in Partial Fulfillment

of the Requirements

for the Degree of

Master of Public Affairs

The University of Texas at Austin

May 2008

Evidence-Based Public Policy toward Cold Fusion

APPROVED BY

SUPERVISING COMMITTEE:

Charles G. Groat

Kenneth Matwiczak

Table of Contents

Table of Contents	9
List of Tables	10
List of Figures	11
List of Acronyms	12
Chapter 1. Introduction	13
Chapter 2. Cold Fusion Origins and Controversy	15
What Is Cold Fusion (Or What Might It Be)?	15
1989 Announcement and Attempts at Verification	17
Repudiation	18
Was CF Rejection Rational?	20
Marginalization and Continued Promise	22
Chapter 3. The Public Interest in Cold Fusion	23
Energy Source	23
Potential New Scientific Field	24
Ethical Considerations	24
Conclusion: the Public Interest in Cold Fusion	25
Chapter 4. Framework: Evidence-Based Policy making	26
Evidence-Based Medicine	27
Rational/Evidence-Based Applications in Other Fields	27
Evidence-Based Policy making	27
Chapter 5. Scientific Evidence of Cold Fusion	28
Burden of Proof	28
Scientific Evidence	29
Observations on Cold Fusion Scientific Evidence	39
Conclusion: Scientific Evidence for Cold Fusion	42
Chapter 6. Level of Evidence for Rational Cold Fusion Policy Making	43
Levels of Evidence	45
Policy Response to Levels of Evidence	46
Cold Fusion Policy Alternatives	47
Conclusion: CF Level of Evidence and Policy Response	48
Chapter 7. Policy Precedents for New Discoveries	49
Paradigm-Shifting Discoveries	49
Public Support of Unproven Phenomena	50
Skepticism and the Public Interest	51
Conclusion: Rational Public Policy toward Unproven Discoveries	53
Chapter 8. Policy Lessons from the Cold Fusion Controversy	55
U.S. Department of Energy 1989 Cold Fusion Report	55
Glenn Seaborg Cold Fusion Advisory to President George Bush	60
U.S. Department of Energy 2004 Cold Fusion Review	62
U.S. Patent Office Responses to Cold Fusion Patent Applications	62
Lessons Learned from Past CF Policy Making	63
Chapter 9. Future Public Policy toward Cold Fusion	64
Next Step: Policy Analysis Study	64
Policy Precedents and Lessons Learned	65
Scope of Policy Analysis Study	65
Policy Analysis Study Design	70
Chapter 10. Conclusions and Recommendations	72
Bibliography	74
Endnote	78
Vita	79